

**Why the Standard Automobile Insurance Market  
Breaks Down in Low-Income Zip Codes**

**A per-mile analysis of Texas auto insurance  
based on testimony before the  
Texas House Committee on Insurance  
April 6 and 13, 1999**

**Report to the Texas House Committee on Insurance**

**by**

**Patrick Butler, Ph.D., Insurance Project Director  
National Organization for Women  
Washington, DC  
and  
Texas NOW  
Austin, TX**

**July 2000**



## Table of Contents

Executive summary .....	1
1. Introduction .....	5
a. Identifying multiple problems caused by <i>per-car</i> premium rates .....	5
b. Mandating a <i>per-mile</i> option — HB 3099 .....	6
c. Using a per-mile measure of cost and profit .....	6
d. Considering testimony – List of House Bills .....	7
2. What angers car owners in higher income zip codes .....	8
a. Large differences in the profit made on each customer — Table 1 .....	8
b. Having to pay for insurance while a car is inoperable .....	9
c. Losing the option to suspend insurance .....	10
d. Low-mileage drivers having to pay for unlimited mileage .....	11
e. Having to pay a premium for each car when cars outnumber drivers .....	12
3. What angers car owners in low income zip codes .....	13
a. Being branded as non-standard as shown by the Birnbaum study .....	13
b. Being rejected by standard agents as unprofitable .....	15
c. Seeing unavailable low premiums in TDI consumer guides — Table 2 .....	16
d. Being blamed for market breakdown .....	18
4. What angers some car owners in all zip codes .....	20
a. Being overcharged for insuring an older car .....	20
b. Being scapegoated for owning an uninsured car .....	21
5. Attaining healthy markets .....	23
a. Diagnosing the causes of consumer anger .....	23
b. Deregulating premiums .....	23
c. Using a database to identify uninsured cars .....	25
d. Prescribing a <i>per-mile</i> option .....	26
e. Enforcing compliance under a <i>per-mile</i> option .....	30
1. Using current methods .....	30
2. Using a database to identify uninsured miles driven .....	33
f. Solving consumer anger .....	35
Index: bills, legislators, subjects, and witnesses .....	36









































































